

## The Effectiveness of the Merit System in Position Mutations in Human Resources and Employment Agency in Padang Panjang City, West Sumatera

Indra Aprilzoni<sup>1</sup>, Februarti Trimurni<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1,2</sup>Faculty of Social and Political Science, University of North Sumatra, Indonesia

[indrazoni@gmail.com](mailto:indrazoni@gmail.com)

### Abstract

Work rotation or rotation is done to avoid the saturation of employees or employees on work routines that are sometimes boring and have other objective functions so that someone can master and explore other jobs in different fields in an organization. Which has a good impact on the professionalism of work and the implementation of organizational goals. For this reason, the government carries out various kinds of business. One way that the government does is by doing how the effectiveness of mutations in improving work quality. then the government expects mutations to be more optimal and achieve predetermined targets. The purpose of this research is to find out how the effectiveness of the Merit system in the position of position in the Personnel Agency and Human Resources Work in Padang Panjang City, West Sumatra Province. This research uses descriptive research method with a qualitative approach. Data collection techniques are carried out by means of interviews, observations and documentation relating to the merit system in job mutations. The data obtained were then analyzed qualitatively by reviewing all data collected, supported by interviews with a theoretical approach proposed by Tangkilisan that organizational effectiveness was measured through Targeting, Adaptation, Satisfaction, Responsibility. Through this research it can be seen that the effectiveness of the merit system in job mutations increases work optimization in an organization. However, there are some things that need to be improved, namely the achievement of targets in providing land and building tax payment services, the quality generated in carrying out mutations, and satisfaction on each performance performed.

### Keywords

effectiveness;  
mutation; merit



## I. Introduction

Sedarmayanti (2012) explains that the form of career development within the Civil Service (PNS) can be done in various ways, including promotions and transfers. Promotion is a dream that is always awaited by Civil Servants (PNS) because it is seen as an award for the success of showing high work performance in fulfilling their obligations in a job or position. Meanwhile, mutation involves the transfer of a position to another equivalent position. Basically, the implementation of job transfer promotions is adjusted to the needs of the organization and career development of civil servants. Civil Servant career positions can be divided into two, namely structural positions and functional positions. Meanwhile, the Government Regulation Number 11 of 2017 and the State Civil Apparatus Law, the ASN Law No. 5 of 2014 concerning Functional Positions for Civil Servants, states that Functional Positions, hereinafter abbreviated as JF, are a group of positions containing

functions and duties related to functional services based on certain skills and expertise. Government Regulation (PP) Number 100 of 2000 concerning Appointment of Civil Servants in Structural Positions states that a structural position is a position that shows the duties, responsibilities, authorities, and rights of a civil servant in order to lead a state organizational unit. Structural positions are closely related to Echelon, namely levels in structural positions that are arranged based on their weight, responsibility, authority, and rights.

Winarsih and Ratminto (2010) explained that, in various research results so far, many have shown that the implementation of promotions and position transfers in both central and local government agencies is carried out in an unclear manner. The effectiveness in the implementation of promotions and transfers is caused by several other factors, such as politics, regional autonomy, ethnicity, race and even alma mater. Therefore, the placement of civil servants in structural positions is an important factor in achieving organizational goals. Mistakes in the appointment and placement of a person in a position can cause obstacles to the administration of government organizations, if they do not use the principle of the right man on the right place. Organization must have a goal to be achieved by the organizational members (Niati et al., 2021). The success of leadership is partly determined by the ability of leaders to develop their organizational culture. (Arif, 2019). To create a smooth administration of government, the State Civil Apparatus is very important, especially when it is associated with creating good governance. The implication of this regulation is that the appointment of a civil servant in a structural position is carried out by considering promotions carried out by a team of assessing the performance of civil servants (PNS).

Rustan (2008) describes several research results in a number of regions that there are still appointments of Civil Servants in structural positions that are not in accordance with the competencies they should have. The placement of structural officials is related to the success team and the proximity factor without being followed by competence and educational background. So far, it is found that the implementation of structural position mutations in both central and local government agencies is carried out in an unclear manner. The mutation itself is carried out openly by the Selection Committee Team, while for echelon II and below it is carried out by the PNS Performance Assessment Team.

Civil Servants as employees of the State Civil Apparatus in their management are regulated in the management of the State Civil Apparatus, namely the Personnel Management System which includes planning systems, career development, payroll, and retirement age limits. ASN is no longer fully the responsibility of the government, because now there is a State Civil Apparatus Commission (KASN). This regulation is expected to be able to improve government management that is oriented to public services, because civil servants are no longer oriented to serving their superiors, but the community. This regulation places civil servants as a profession that is free from political intervention and will implement an open career system that prioritizes the principle of professionalism, which has competence, qualifications, performance, transparency, objectivity, and is free from political intervention and KKN based on human resource management and Prioritizing the Merit system towards the realization of a professional government bureaucracy, being neutral, not easily carried away by political currents and not allowed to lobby for promotions. Civil servants who are appointed to certain ranks and positions in Government Agencies are part of the management of ASN with principles that are carried out based on professional principles, and avoid the practice of corruption, collusion, and

nepotism. To implement this principle, ASN management is carried out with a merit system. The merit system is a system that applies to ASN in Indonesia as stated in Article 51 of Law no. 5 of 2014. The Merit System is a policy and management of human resources of Apparatus based on qualifications, competence, and performance in a fair and reasonable manner, without distinction of political background, race, color, religion, origin, gender, marital status, age, or disability condition. The merit system is a staffing system which in appointing employees is based on skills (Moekijat, 1991).

Padang Panjang City Government for the implementation of the transfer itself was not easy. In accordance with the provisions of Article 131 PP Number 11 of 2017 concerning the management of Civil Servants, the Padang Panjang City Government some time ago carried out a job transfer, in this mutation the Padang Panjang government conducted an open selection to fill the position of high pratama leadership (regional secretary) of Padang Panjang City based on a letter Circular Number: 821/03/Pansel-JPT-PP/I-2018, this selection occurred because the position of the Padang Panjang Regional Secretary has been vacant since April 2017, appointed as Plt. The old Secretary of State Indra Gusnady, SE. M.Si, nearing the end of his term of office as mayor for the 2013-2018 period, Hendri Arnis then appointed the Head of the PPKB P3A Social Service, Martoni, as the Acting Sekdako. Martoni has carried out this task until now. When Martoni was appointed as acting, actually the selection process for the Definitive Sekdako had reached the top three, but because the process of implementing the new Padang Panjang mayoral election resulted in a delay in the selection process that had been carried out, this selection had to be decided based on a decision from the mayor of Padang Panjang City.

To obtain professional position mutations results, it is necessary to pay attention to the effectiveness of the implementation of the merit system. Miller (in Tangkilisan 2007), explains that the meaning of effectiveness and efficiency is "Effectiveness is intended as the level of how far a social system achieves its goals. This effectiveness must be distinguished from efficiency. Efficiency implies a comparison between costs and results, while effectiveness is directly related to the achievement of a goal. The criteria or indicators of effectiveness according to Tangkilisan (2005) are; achievement of targets, adaptability, job satisfaction, and responsibility. the application of an effective merit system will result in professional and optimal position mutations.

## II. Review of Literature

This type of research used in this research is descriptive research with a qualitative approach. According to Arikunto (2013) descriptive research is research that is intended to collect information about the status of existing symptoms, namely the state of symptoms according to what they were at the time the research was conducted. Descriptive research is not intended to test certain hypotheses, but only describes what it is about a variable, symptom or situation. Qualitative research is research that intends to understand the phenomena of what is experienced by research subjects holistically, by means of descriptions in the form of words and language in a special natural context and by utilizing various natural methods (Moleong, 2014). The research location taken by the researcher is the City of Padang Panjang with the research site of the Head of the Civil Servant Performance Assessment Team (PNS) with consideration, namely the members in the Padang Panjang City Civil Servant Performance Assessment Team (PNS) at the Personnel and Resource Work Agency. Man (BKPSDM) Padang Panjang City. Sources of data in research are subjects from which data can be obtained (Arikunto, 2013). Sources of data in this study are divided into two types, namely as follows; (1) Informants, Lofland (in

Moleong, 2014) recording the main data sources through interviews or observations is the result of a combined effort of seeing, listening and asking. In this study, primary data was obtained by conducting in-depth interviews with the Head of the Civil Servant Performance Assessment Team (PNS) and employees in the Padang Panjang City Civil Servant Performance Assessment Team (PNS). (2) Documentation, secondary data sources in the form of additional material derived from documents in the study obtained from literature, journals, documents and related archives through the Head of the Civil Servant Performance Assessment Team (PNS) Padang Panjang City, West Sumatra Province.

### **III. Result and Discussion**

To analyze the Effectiveness of the Merit System Implementation in Position Transfers at the Agency for Personnel and Human Resources Employment, 4 (four) indicators are used from the Tangklisan Policy Effectiveness model as follows:

#### **3.1 Target Achievement**

The purpose of achieving targets here is defined as the extent to which the targets can be set by the organization and can be realized properly. This can be seen from the extent to which the implementation of organizational goals in achieving targets is in accordance with the goals that have been set, which we can see in the vision and mission of the BKPSDM itself where they target the realization of a professional apparatus.

Civil servants are elements of the state apparatus whose duty is to provide services to the community in a professional, honest, fair and equitable manner in carrying out state, government and development tasks. The position and role of structural officials are very decisive because they are the backbone of government and national development. Therefore, in the implementation of structural position mutations, the Law, Government Regulation and Career Pattern System regulates that the transfer of employees of regional apparatus organizations can be carried out objectively and fairly. In this condition, the system that is run in carrying out mutations must be adjusted to the workload in each work function. In the city of Padang Panjang itself also implements planning and preparation of the number of employee needs in accordance with the workload. In addition, the preparation and determination of the need for the number and type of PNS positions is carried out in accordance with the budget cycle that is owned in the area.

In the City of Padang Panjang, this employee arrangement is adjusted to the Regulation of the Head of the State Civil Service Agency Number 19 of 2011 concerning General Guidelines for Compiling the Needs of Civil Servants. Where, in the context of national personnel planning and realizing the number and quality of Civil Servants in accordance with the needs of state organizational units and to ensure a proportional distribution of Civil Servants, it is necessary to analyze the needs of Civil Servants within the Central Institution and Regional Agencies. The stages of needs analysis for Civil Servants include data and information collection, evaluation of employee needs, preparation of employee reallocation plans, and preparation of additional plans for the formation of new employees.

Looking at the planning of employee needs, it is necessary to do some analysis of the needs of civil servants and the supply of civil servants. The analysis of the needs of civil servants is related to the criteria possessed by the civil servants themselves, while the analysis of the supply of civil servants is related to the condition of vacancies for employees in a government agency. In this case, the City of Padang Panjang focuses more on these two things in transferring employees. The analysis is intended to find a match in

filling in the results of employee mutations. This means that the recruitment of employees from the mutation results can be adjusted to the needs or criteria of the agency that you want to occupy.

### **3.2 Adaptability**

The success of an organization is seen from the extent to which the organization can adapt to changes that occur both from within the organization and outside the organization. The existing conditions at BKPSDM are in accordance with the opinion of Siagian (1994) quoted by Irawan (2002) which explains that employee planning is certain steps taken by organizational management in order to provide the right personnel to occupy various positions, positions and positions. the right job, at the right time in order to achieve the goals that have been and will be set. Similar to the opinion of Hasibuan (1994) which says that employee planning is planning the workforce to suit the needs of the organization and be effective and efficient in helping the realization of goals. Based on this theory, planning for employee needs is important to do in the hope of matching employee competencies with organizational needs.

Competency standards in every government agency have been formed and have been implemented. However, in practice, the needs of employees and the provisions that have been set experience different conditions. This means that the need for employees to be transferred is adjusted to the needs of the institution. In this case, based on the interviews described above, it can be concluded that the PNS Performance Assessment Team has met all competency standards that must be met by government officials in terms of transferring positions in Padang Panjang City by adhering to Law Number 5 of 2014 concerning Apparatus State Civil Service, Government Regulation Number 11 of 2017 concerning Management of Civil Servants and Regulation of the Head of the State Civil Service Agency Number 7 of 2013 concerning Guidelines for Preparation of Managerial Competency Standards. In general, in terms of job transfers carried out by the Padang Panjang City Civil Service Performance Assessment Team, it is carried out in stages by involving fields and sub-fields to staff as input in providing considerations for structural position mutations. In addition, employee transfers are adjusted to the abilities of the employees and the needs of the organization itself.

### **3.3 Satisfaction**

Civil servants who have shown loyalty, dedication, skills, honesty, discipline, and work performance in carrying out their duties can be rewarded. The award can be in the form of giving; honors, special promotions, priority opportunities for competitive development, opportunities to attend official events and/or state events. The award in the form of a mark of honor is given to civil servants in accordance with the provisions of the legislation. Awards in the form of special promotions are given to civil servants based on performance appraisals and extraordinary expertise in carrying out their duties. However, in addition to the award, there are also sanctions that can be given by every civil servant if he commits a violation while carrying out his duties.

Competency development carried out at the BKPSDM Padang Panjang City is carried out in accordance with the positions of employees held in the agency. Information regarding employee positions can be seen from the information system run by BKPSDM, namely the Padang Panjang City BKPSDM website. Furthermore, after regarding these positions, BKPSDM designs and carries out leadership training or other competency training in accordance with the division of positions. Efforts to implement the training carried out by BKPSDM are aimed at increasing the capacity of employees so that the

human resources they have can be of high quality and can improve organizational performance.

### **3.4 Responsibility**

The organization can carry out the mandate that has been carried out in accordance with the provisions that have been made previously, and can face and resolve problems that occur with its work. Government organizations in terms of structuring the filling of positions are carried out open selection and promotion to employees who will occupy vacant positions. Promotion is a form of career pattern that can be vertical and diagonal. Civil Servants can be promoted in Administrative Positions and Functional Positions by fulfilling the requirements of the Position by taking into account the needs of the organization. In Padang Panjang City, the selection and promotion are carried out separately by a team sent by the mayor, open selection is only carried out by the Selection Committee for High Leadership Positions and for Echelon II and below the mutation and promotion system or determination of position considerations is carried out by the Assessment Team of Civil Servant Performance.

Implementation of selection and promotion for civil servants is done by looking at the positions held. High Pratama positions are positions that are promoted openly. Meanwhile, echelon II and lower positions are only assessed by the PNS Performance Assessment Team. In Government Regulation Number 11 of 2017 concerning Management of Civil Servants, it is explained that promotion is a form of career pattern that can be vertical or diagonal. Vertical, namely the movement from one position to another higher position, within a group of JA, JF, or JPT. While the diagonal is the movement from one position to another higher position between groups of JA, JF, or JPT.

Open promotion of civil servants can be done by considering the position held by the civil servant. If in a high position then open promotion can be done nationally. However, if the civil servant is in an administrative or functional position, no open promotion is carried out nationally, only within the scope of the region. In addition, in the selection of civil servants, several selections were also carried out. In this case, there are several mechanisms that are run by each agency, including the City of Padang Panjang. The following is the selection mechanism for inter-regional civil servant mutations that will enter Padang Panjang City, namely; formation selection, competency selection, performance selection, selection/non-technical study.

Each agency has its own mechanism in conducting employee transfers, either transfers from outside or transfers to a regional agency. In Padang Panjang City, the mutation mechanism implemented is adjusted to the Padang Panjang City BKD regulations regarding the Requirements and Mechanisms for Admission and Transfer of Civil Servants from and to the Padang Panjang City Government. With this, the selection mechanism implemented is adjusted to the needs of the organization and must pass several provisions in the process of implementing the mutation. Therefore, from the results of the interviews and the data above, it can be concluded that in an open selection it is only carried out by the Selection Committee Team, for the Administrative Positions or echelon II and below it is carried out by the PNS Performance Assessment Team. In addition, promotions open to civil servants can be carried out depending on the determination of positions that are allowed for promotion. During the mutation process, several selections were made before transferring employees. The selection is regulated in the existing laws and regulations.

## IV. Conclusion

The effectiveness of the Merit System Implementation in Position Transfers in the Agency for Personnel and Human Resources Work is good, because with the implementation of the merit system, it is hoped that employees with high integrity will be formed, because the entire process of implementing employee transfers is based on established regulations and standards. The achievement of the target can be concluded that in forming professional employees, BKPSDM performs according to the standards of the merit system itself, in this case, the City of Padang Panjang also focuses on analysis in conducting employee transfers. The analysis is intended to find a match in filling out the results of employee mutations. This means that the recruitment of employees from the mutation results can be adjusted to the needs or criteria of the agency they want to occupy, so that employees can work effectively and efficiently. Adaptability, the PNS Performance Assessment Team has met all competency standards that must be met by government officials in terms of transferring positions in Padang Panjang City. In general, in terms of job transfers carried out by the Padang Panjang City Civil Service Performance Assessment Team, it is carried out in stages by involving fields and sub-fields to staff as input in providing considerations for structural position mutations. In addition, employee transfers are adjusted to the abilities of the employees and the needs of the organization itself, so that employees can work effectively and efficiently. Satisfaction concluded that the award and sanction were enforced in accordance with the legislation that had been set. Awards are given to civil servants when they show loyalty, dedication, skills, honesty, discipline, and work performance. Every civil servant has the right to get an award when in these conditions. However, it is not only awards that can be given by the state to civil servants, but also sanctions that must be accepted by civil servants who commit violations in carrying out their duties. Sanctions for civil servants who violate the rules are adjusted to the type of violation committed. Responsibilities are concluded. Government organizations in terms of structuring open selection and promotion to employees who will occupy positions, each agency has its own mechanism in carrying out employee transfers, either mutations from outside or transfers to a regional agency. In Padang Panjang City, the mutation mechanism implemented is adjusted to the Padang Panjang City BKD regulations regarding the Requirements and Mechanisms for Admission and Transfer of Civil Servants from and to the Padang Panjang City Government. With this, the selection mechanism implemented is adjusted to the needs of the organization and must pass several provisions in the process of implementing the mutation. Therefore, from the results of the interviews and the data above, it can be concluded that in an open selection it is only carried out by the Selection Committee Team, for the Administrative Positions or echelon II and below it is carried out by the PNS Performance Assessment Team.

## References

- Arif, S. (2019). Influence of Leadership, Organizational Culture, Work Motivation, and Job Satisfaction of Performance Principles of Senior High School in Medan City. *Budapest International Research and Critics Institute-Journal (BIRCI-Journal)*. P. 239-254
- Arikunto, Suharsimi. (2013). *Prosedur Penelitian: Suatu Pendekatan Praktik*. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta.
- Hasibuan, S.P. Malayu. (1994). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.

- Irawan, Prasetya, dkk. (2002). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Jakarta: STIALAN Press.
- Moekijat. (1991). *Perencanaan Tenaga Kerja*. Bandung: Pionir Jaya.
- Moelong, Lexy J. (2014). *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif Edisi Revisi*. Bandung: PT. Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Niati, D. R., Siregar, Z. M. E., & Prayoga, Y. (2021). The Effect of Training on Work Performance and Career Development: The Role of Motivation as Intervening Variable. *Budapest International Research and Critics Institute (BIRCI-Journal): Humanities and Social Sciences*, 4(2), 2385–2393. <https://doi.org/10.33258/birci.v4i2.1940>
- Peraturan Kepala Badan Kepegawaian Negara Nomor 19 Tahun 2011 tentang Pedoman Umum Penyusunan Kebutuhan Pegawai Negeri Sipil.
- Peraturan Kepala Badan Kepegawaian Negara Nomor 7 Tahun 2013 tentang Pedoman Penyusunan Standar Kompetensi Manajerial.
- Peraturan Pemerintah Nomor 100 Tahun 2000 tentang Pengangkatan Pegawai Negeri Sipil Dalam Jabatan Struktural.
- Peraturan Pemerintah Nomor 11 Tahun 2017 tentang Jabatan Pimpinan Tinggi.
- Rustan, Suroto. (2008). *Layout Dasar & Penerapannya*. Jakarta: PT Gramedia Pustaka.
- Sedarmayanti. (2012). *Manajemen dan Komponen Terkait Lainnya*. Bandung: Refika Aditama.
- Siagian, Sondang P. (1994). *Administrasi Pembangunan*. Jakarta: Gedung Agung.
- Tangkilisan, Hessel. (2005). *Manajemen Publik*. Jakarta: PT Grasindo.
- \_\_\_\_\_. (2007). *Manajemen Publik*. Jakarta: PT Grasindo.
- Undang-Undang Nomor 5 Tahun 2014 Tentang Aparatur Sipil Negara.
- Winarsih, Atik Septi., & Ratminto. (2010). *Manajemen Pelayanan*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.